

**LENT MEETING OF THE ESTATES COMMITTEE
AGENDA**

**2:00pm Wednesday 24 February 2021
Virtual Meeting on Teams**

Present: Professor Phil Allmendinger (Chair); Dr Tamara Follini (Chair of the Conservation Committee, ex officio); Dr Andrew Friend; Mr Adam Hardy (UCS Representative); Professor Wendy Pullan; Dr Jacqueline Tasioulas (Senior Tutor); Mr Paul Warren (Bursar); and Mr Will Wood (MCR President).

In Attendance: Dr Jo Costin (Secretary); Miss Emma Easterbrook (Assistant Bursar); Ms Deborah Hoy (Estates Director); Mr Jason Randall (IT Manager);

1. **Apologies**

Professor Howard Griffiths (Chair of the Gardens Committee, ex officio); Mr Brenan Morgan (Head Porter); and Mr Daniel Parle (MCR Representative).

2. **Declarations of Interest**

There were no declarations of interest.

3. **Minutes of the Last Meeting**

Note that the last meeting was conducted via circulation, and therefore there are no minutes for Oct 2020.

4. **Matters Arising**

Matters arising covered within items below.

5. **Matters from the MCR / UCS**

a. ***Clare Community***

Living in College accommodation was an important part of making graduate students part of the community. The MCR was invited to consult with its members on a meeting after Easter to discuss estates strategy (see below).

b. ***Rent Range***

The MCR was concerned that all available rooms were in a more expensive price bracket. It was felt that the new St Regis site did offer good value for money, but this was outside the means of most postgraduate students. Rents on other properties had also risen, reducing the availability of lower price bracket accommodation.

This would be discussed at a meeting after Easter if the MCR wished.

PA / WW

c. ***Services / Maintenance Issues***

Graduate students asked that outstanding maintenance and furniture issues be resolved and had some concerns around the ticketing system.

The MCR had been contacted prior to the meeting with requests for a list of maintenance issues, so that these could be investigated in detail. One issue had been received, relating to a leak in a room following improper use of the shower above the room.

Will Wood has sent out a survey to the MCR, but has had only limited responses. The list to date to be sent to the Estates Director for investigation. Without this information it was not possible to take any action. It was agreed that the best forum for these issues going forwards was the Accommodation Subcommittee, which would refer the minutes to Estates Committee.

WW / DH

The Buildings Department looked into all open tickets, and found no outstanding issues.

d. ***St Regis***

Members of the MCR were fully involved in the design of the St Regis project. They had indicated a preference for affordability over size. This was taken into account and room sizes reduced. 102 and 108 Chesterton Road both contain rooms with no individual en-suites. The initial proposed rents proposed were around 20% higher than those actually implemented as a result of the changes. Rents on new build accommodation in other colleges are significantly higher than those at St Regis.

e. ***Ticketing System***

There was potential to adjust the Ticketing System, which could be changed to a certain extent. A meeting to be held with the Estates Director, IT Manager, and MCR representative.

WW / DH /
JR

f. ***UCS Accommodation***

The UCS supported the idea of an Accommodation Strategy meeting. There had been repeated mould / damp problems in some of the Colony rooms, including Etheldreda, Castle House, and Castle End, and a review of this was requested. These were largely related to thermal insulation within these properties, with the exception of Castle End where there had been some roofing issues. The 5 year programme included double glazing for Castle House. Secondary glazing had been installed over the past two years in Etheldreda, and this was down to have an air source heat pump installed which would mean careful inspection of the thermal insulation. There were some ongoing issues with older properties at the Colony which had been picked up and were being worked on.

g. ***Contracts***

The MCR also raised a concern that the postgraduate contracts followed the same model as undergraduate ones.

6. ***Old Court***

a. ***Hot Water Issues following Completion of Phase 1a***

Following completion the hot water has not been reaching the correct temperatures, leading to a risk of legionella growing in the system. The Estates Director, Bursar, and Project Manager are discussing actions, including legal action against the M&E consultant. There have been around £100,000 of additional costs through the failure of the design. It was hoped to transfer £100,000 of unspent contingency funds from 1a to 1b (the contingencies for 1b are very low and pose a financial risk) but this is no longer possible owing to the hot water issues.

PW / DH

All showers in Old Court have been taken out of use, and work is ongoing to resolve the issues. Actions so far include heating the pipes and chlorination, but a long term solution is still required. The situation is being kept under review by the Old Court Implementation Group.

b. **Progress Phase 1b**

Unknown Items: The project has encountered a number of unknown items in the last few weeks following a good start on site. This includes previously unknown asbestos, and an 18th Century culvert running to the river, full of water, and with a number of interesting archaeological finds. These are historically valuable, but they are not thought to have a high monetary value.

Extension of Time: There is currently a delay of up to 12 weeks. This means not completing the kitchen and Great Hall in early June, with knock on effects on the temporary catering facilities. There is time to get the programme back on track, and the contractor is working hard to reprogramme to reduce delay. The site area is not large enough to easily mitigate delays caused by asbestos / archaeology / etc.

Interiors Appointment: Two interior designers and WWM quoted for the interior design work. WWM gave the most favourable quote, and it is intended to move forwards with them. It will be made clear that there is a limited budget for River Room furniture. They will be asked to provide initial thoughts and these will be circulated to Old Court Working Group and the Conservation Committee, who can subsequently hold a joint meeting. This will also include looking at the light fittings. The proposals from the quotes will be circulated in the first instance. The Estates Director will let the Chair of the Conservation Committee know the proposed timescale.

DH / TF

7. **St Regis Project Update**

a. **Completion:** The student blocks have now been completed. There are some outstanding snagging issues, but nothing that wouldn't be expected. Owing to Covid, the Buildings Administrator has been notifying students of all works taking place, even when they have no direct impact on students. The first two-three weeks had a fairly high number of issues identified, but this has now slowed down. The Senior Tutor congratulated the Estates Director, Chair of Estates Committee, and Bursar on the completion. The building offered a high standard of living and was a wonderful piece of architecture.

b. **Hamilton Road Flats:** Due to complete at the end of the week (26 Feb) with a contractual completion date of 13 March. The contractor is reporting a 12 week delay (completion on 21 May), owing to Covid. Due diligence is being carried out on this, with potential to activate a penalty clause for non-completion.

c. **Site History:** Writing was found on the archway of 108 Chesterton Road while carrying out the finishes. That on the front has been restored, and is from the New England Primer (1860s educational text). St Regis was also the home of Richarda Morrow-Tait, the first woman to fly around the world, when it was luxury flats. There are a number of photos, and a book about her life is available to borrow from the Forbes Mellon Library. The Chair of the Estates Committee has contacted the City Council about getting a blue plaque to commemorate her.

8. **Queen Edith's / Netherfield Redevelopment**

a. **Background:** The redevelopment proposals have been underway for around 2 years, though were on hold owing to the St Regis project. There are two large sites which have a very inefficient use of space. The

intention is to sell one of the sites and use the funds to help redevelop the other to provide student accommodation close to the biomedical campus.

- b. **Netherfield Proposals:** The current proposal is to redevelop the Netherfield site, building 24 student rooms and 3 one bedroom flats which would be sold on the private market. The total cost of the redevelopment would be around £3.85 million (including VAT). £1 million of the funding would come from the sale of the flats. This would mean a long term loan of £2.85 million, to be paid off over 25/30 years. The model is similar to that used for St Regis.
- c. **Rents:** Rents would be higher in the newly refurbished rooms. However, both sites currently require significant essential back maintenance and improvement, which would also push up rental costs to fund. Proposed rents are £190 p.w. for a studio flat (approx. 24m²), en suite £175 (20m²), and basic rooms at approximately £150 p.w. The rent increase which would be necessary to keep the flats going to be worked out. PW
- d. **MCR:** The MCR raised a concern that this would exacerbate issues with rents. The sites were amongst the cheapest rooms available, and were prioritised for medics and those based on the Addenbrookes site. The MCR President will contact current residents for feedback.
- e. **Current Site:** The site currently experiences damp and condensation problems, and requires reroofing.
- f. **Proposed Site:** The proposal that has gone forwards from the last Estates Committee meeting include 4 studios, 10 en suite bedrooms, and 10 non en suite rooms. The Senior Tutor raised that lessons learned from the current pandemic suggested a greater proportion of en suites be included in future new builds.
- g. **Recommendation:** Prior to recommending the proposal to Finance Committee it the matter of improvements and rents would be discussed at the meeting after Easter. This would go to Finance Committee shortly after Easter, in order not to impact on the October 2022 proposed start on site.

9. Memorial Court Boiler Replacement

- a. **Current Situation:** It has not been possible to move this forwards significantly. Bouygues / Element Energy who are advising the University have visited site and submitted a strategy document suggesting a sequence of Ground Source Heat Pumps around Memorial Court. This could be done in a phased manner, at a cost of £2 million to £4 million. Previous costs were at least £2.5 million. This is a sustainable solution and not a business case solution, owing to the high capital cost. A non-gas solution will be needed in the future. The issue is becoming pressing owing to the regular failure of the boilers in P Staircase, which are 23 years old. The sustainable solution remains a leap into the unknown, as there does not seem to have been a project on the scale of Memorial Court in the past.
- b. **Changing Costs / Legislation:** There was a concern that costs may decrease significantly, and that legal requirements were changing rapidly. However, any delay to the project increased the risk of complete boiler failure. The boilers in P Staircase, responsible for heating P, Q, and R Staircases, support heating and hot water for around 42 students. Temporary electric heaters were not an option as the electricians would not support more than five per staircase.
- c. **P Staircase:** It was agreed to get costs for replacing the boilers in P Staircase with new gas boilers, which was included as a potential option DH

within the strategy. However, there would still be some issues with flues to overcome.

- d. **UCS / MCR:** The students were asked to carry out a survey of opinions, as redirecting £4 million to the sustainable heating / hot water solution would mean not carrying out a significant number of improvement and refurbishment works elsewhere. There was support for it as a green initiative, however it was not possible to fund both this and the items proposed in the 5 year plan.

10. **Sportsground, Cambridge United**

This item is for note only.

The Assistant Bursar circulated eight papers to the Estates Committee including a general review of the Sportsground and its usage. Briefly, the Standing Committee has agreed not unanimously to allow Cambridge United to apply for planning permission to replace their current second-hand Portakabins at the Sportsground with a new build at their own cost. However, Cambridge United understand that the College is under no obligation to permit the build even if planning permission is granted.

The background is that Cambridge United have been a tenant at the Sportsground since 2007. They would like to continue being a long-term tenant and wish to invest in the site, which would also be of benefit to the College. They paid for irrigation of one football pitch last year and intend to do the same for a two further pitches. They are also reviewing the drainage (as a result of more building by the College's neighbours flooding has become an issue). Regarding the new build they are interested in connecting to the main lines sewage, which would remove the potential issue of contaminating Hobson's Conduit/Vicar's Brook. At present there are currently two tanks which are drained every three weeks from both their Portakabins and our Pavilion. The financial proposal is a loan from the College to Cambridge United over a 20 year period and the College would ultimately own the building. Any building contract would be between the contractor for the build and Cambridge United. This aspect would be looked at by the Finance Committee.

Any further updates will be provided to the Chair of the Estates Committee and the Estates Director, and then via the Estates Committee.

Concerns: The Estates Committee raised concerns around the financial stability of Cambridge United, and whether the facilities would benefit the College or whether it would make it more difficult for students to use the Sportsground.

11. **External Houses Strategy**

- a. **Background:** When Clare Court was redeveloped, it was intended to sell off the external houses. However, they were kept until the completion of St Regis, with a view to house prices increasing further. House prices have risen, but there is limited potential for them to rise in the next few years. Two additional properties were purchased during the St Regis redevelopment (33 and 102 Chesterton Road).
- b. **Available Accommodation:** Following the St Regis redevelopment, the College had sufficient accommodation available. The external houses are amongst the cheapest available, but there has been little demand from

students outside this year, and they were previously let to other Colleges (specifically 120 and 190 Chesterton Road).

- c. **Financial Case:** It was expected to take around a year to sell the external houses. The two houses from donations were always intended to be sold – 95 Hemingford Way was delayed owing to covid, but is now under offer.

12. **AccessAble Audit and App**

This has been recommended by the General Purchasing Sub Committee to all Colleges, and taken up by the University and Disability Resource Centre. The College does not have an up to date access survey, and this company also provide an app. The app allows potential students, members of College, and conference guests to understand how they would navigate to a particular room and what obstacles they would encounter, going into specific details (e.g. whether a shelf in a disabled toilet is on the left or right). This will enable greater transparency, and can feed into the annual programme of works.

Clare was initially banded with Trinity and St Johns, but the Estates Director has requested a lower banding as Old Court cannot currently be surveyed. The initial survey will be carried out in Memorial Court and the Colony and the routes to and from those areas.

The Estates Committee supported this proposal.

13. **5 Year Programme**

- a. **Overview:** The Five Year Programme included items approved in the past, and what the College was looking to approve in the future. These were primarily building related works, informed by the 2016/17 condition survey and anecdotal evidence (e.g. from students who did not wish to return to Braeside).

- b. **Major Refurbishments:** Three areas were highlighted for major refurbishment: Braeside (1920s building in poor condition, for 22/23), Hillside (more substantial Victorian building, for 23/24) and PQR Staircases in a similar project to the KLM project of 3-4 years ago (for 25/26). The PQR works were supported by Conference to improve the standard of rooms that can be let out, and would also deal with some of the roofing problems in Memorial Court.

- c. **Other Items:** Other items on the programme included those from the condition survey, and to enhance the sustainability of the College estate. Boilers remain one of the biggest items.

- d. **Financial Overview:** The College has committed to putting approximately £1 million a year into the Old Court fund, within a total special expenditure of £2.5 million. However, recent losses mean the budget has been revised down to £2.2 million for 2021/22. A proposal is being made to Finance Committee for a total of £2.2 million, with £900,000 to Old Court and £1.3 million to other projects. The College needs to sell some of the assets in order to fund the current negative cash flow.

- e. **Approval:** Estates Committee supported the five year programme going forwards.

14. **Bids for Special Capital Expenditure 2021-22**

The Committee approved the proposed Special Capital Expenditure bids. See table of bids attached at the end of these minutes.

15. **Update on Special Expenditure 2020-21**

- a. **Budget:** The projects for 2020-21 were budgeted at £700,000 in total, with £600,000 on eight projects and £100,000 for emergency works. The overall programme has been much smaller than in previous years.
- b. **Summary of Work:**
Much of the work has been disrupted by Covid.
St Andrews Boilers: Retendered in January, now in a position to place the order, with works to be carried out in the summer. The money will be committed in this financial year, but spent in the net financial year.
Internal Decorations: An additional room was done, leading to a slight overspend.
Memorial court Boilers: These were included in this year's budget for funding, but other than a small amount of consultancy fees it is unlikely to spend the full £390,000 budgeted. This money will go towards the deficit.
Memorial Court Electrics: This was the final part of a 5 year programme and was completed under budget.
Forbes Mellon Gates: Project to resume in April, with a view to having the gates fitted in June.
Sewerage Plant Sportsground: On hold owing to issues raised above.
Queen Edith's / Netherfields: Some fees expended, and it is expected that the full amount will be expended by the end of the Financial Year.
IT Upgrades: Revised quotes received within budget, the project is about to begin.

18. **Zero Carbon Strategy**

The Special Expenditure Bid for 2021/22 included £20,000 for the support of consultants to create a roadmap for Zero Carbon. An initial proposal was received within the last few days. The hope is to carry out the work in the most effective way possible, rather than picking out items individually. The proposals will be brought to Estates Committee with a view to taking them forwards in 2021/22.

It had been agreed for a group under Estates Committee to take Zero Carbon proposals forwards (lead by Professor Phil Allmendinger and Professor Andrew Balmford). This had been delayed somewhat, but will be discussed in more detail at the next Estates Committee. Dr Andrew Friend to also comment on the draft Zero Carbon Strategy proposal.

19. **Date of Next Meeting**

26 May 2021

Distribution: Professor Phil Allmendinger (Chair); Professor Andrew Balmford (Chair of the Environment Committee, ex officio); Dr Jo Costin (Secretary); Miss Emma Easterbrook (Assistant Bursar); Dr Tamara Follini (Chair of the Conservation Committee, ex officio); Dr Andrew Friend; Professor Howard Griffiths (Chair of the Gardens Committee, ex officio); Mr Adam Hardy (UCS Representative); Ms Deborah Hoy (Estates Director); Mr Brenan Morgan (Head Porter); Mr Danny Parle (MCR Representative); Professor Wendy Pullan; Mr Jason Randall (IT Manager); Dr Jacqueline Tasioulas (Senior Tutor); and Mr Paul Warren (Bursar).
For information: Ella Nevill (UCS President); Will Wood (MCR President).

2021-2022

		21/22	Comments
Location	Remedial Works		
Ethelreda	Bathroom/Kitchen upgrades /window secondary glazing	£15,000	21/22 will allow completion of upgrading of bathrooms, kitchens and provisions of secondary glazing
Ethelreda	Air Source Heat pumps	£30,000	Push towards Carbon zero, initially start with a small building
St Andrews and St Giles Boiler	Essential Upgrade of the Gas Meter	£30,000	Postponed from 20/21 due to increased costs after lockdown 1 is linked to the boiler replacement projects
Breaside	Refurbishment and Roof extension	£60,000	Potential to achieve additional rooms and ensuite, to improve insulation and look at carbon zero heating
Castle House	Relay paving	£25,000	Coursing H&S issues was raised a few years ago, and minimal works carried out but raised again in sept 20 as H&S issue
Castle Street	Damp problems Bedrooms	£5,000	Room 1, previously treated in 2016
12a Castle Street	Upgrade electrics	£10,000	From 2016 condition survey
12a Castle Street	Refurbish Heating, ventilation, and bathrooms	£20,000	From 2016 condition survey
69 Alpha Rd	Air Source Heat pumps	£20,000	Small property to move to Carbon Zero.
69 Alpha Rd	Update kitchens and bathroom plus some paving	£15,000	This house has not had bathroom or kitchen upgraded (unlike other outside properties)
67 Chesterton Rd	Investigate Cracking		In Buildings Budget
67 Chesterton Rd	External paving handrail		In Buildings Budget
Clare Court Phase 2	External decorations and repairs	£11,000	Last decorated on completion in 2013
Thirkill Court	Internal decorations (completes Priority 1&2 rooms)	£14,314	In-House survey of rooms in 19 identified decoration in 3 priority groups this is the last phase of Priority 1&2
Memorial Court	Install electric charging point	£5,000	to encourage electric car use by Staff and Fellows
Ashby and Memorial Courts	Boiler replace either £250k or spread over five years	£605,000	Timing is difficult and decision if central boiler plant (additional funding To £1.8m)
Lerner Court	Internal decoration X staircase	£11,900	
Old Court	Fellows Library improvements	£10,000	to carried out prior to return of books in summer 22
Forbes Mellon Library	Forbes Mellow External decoration	£19,000	Postponed from 20/21
33 Chesterton	Split into flats	£120,000	Split into 2-3 flats for rental
Memorial Court	Roof to Porters Lodge	£120,000	Postponed twice from 19/20(enable to get a tender) 20/21 due to Covid
All sites	Condition Survey	£26,000	Due every five years last one in 2016
All sites	Zero Carbon Strategy	£20,000	With the govt target of 2050 and University target of 2038 this is help Clare College establish a route map to Carbon zero
All Undergraduate sites	AccessAble Guide creation	£7,650	
Emergency Reserve		£100,000	
Year Totals for Bids		£1,299,864	
Budget for Special Capital Expenditure		£1,300,000	
Unallocated		£136	
Old Court contribution		£1,500,000	
Total Budget Available		£2,800,000	

Queen Ediths and Netherfield	Redevelopment of Site Consultants Fees only in 21/22	£100,000	Not funded from the Special Capital Expenditure
------------------------------	--	----------	---