

Lent Meeting of the Estates Committee
Minutes
2pm Wednesday 18 May 2022
Domus Room

Present: Mr David Ball (Bursar); Miss Emma Easterbrook (Assistant Bursar); Dr Tamara Follini; Dr Andrew Friend; Ms Glynnis Maynard (MCR Representative); and Professor Wendy Pullan.

In Attendance: Dr Jo Costin (Secretary); Ms Deborah Hoy (Estates Director); and Mr Jason Randall (IT Manager).

1. **Apologies**

Professor Phil Allmendinger (Chair) and Professor Jacqueline Tasioulas (Senior Tutor).

2. **Declarations of Interest**

The Assistant Bursar declared an interest as the purchaser of Mowbray's Farmhouse.

The new Old Court Project Manager, Jonah Balmford, is the son of Professor Andrew Balmford, Henry Riley had asked before allocating him to the project. The College saw no conflict of interest.

3. **Minutes of 23 February 2022**

The minutes were agreed.

4. **Matters Arising**

a. **House Sales**

117 Histon Road (sale price £483,500) is hoped to exchange in the next few weeks, contract has been signed and sealed.

Mowbray's Farmhouse needs to complete at the end of June at the latest, with all parties hoping to complete sooner.

b. **Clare St Regis End of Defects**

Three major issues remain to resolve. These are: Central block overheating (there is no ventilation or openable windows in the corridors, this is believed to be a design defect); CHP system is not operating as efficiently as anticipated; and there are some gaps on the fire doors, awaiting a proposal from the contractor to rectify.

The end of defects for the Hamilton Road (commercially let) block is due 25 May. Inspections have taken place during the last month, with very few items picked up.

There are also some minor items outstanding on the student blocks.

c. **Health and Wellbeing Centre**

This project has been completed successfully, and was well managed by Chris Swaysland (Buildings Manager).

5. **Old Court**

a. **Progress Phase 1b**

Works on site are generally progressing well. Noisy work will be suspended for the exam period (largely for the benefit of Trinity Hall). The current level of contingency has not been sufficient, and is being reassessed. The timeline for completion is also at risk. A number of significant design items have been

closed out, but there are outstanding risks from wider supply chain issues. This has primarily affected cost and availability of materials, although labour prices have also significantly increased which could affect provisional sums. The project is being reprogrammed, once the five week restrictions for noisy works are over and the contingency, programme, and risks are kept under review by the Old Court Implementation Group.

The Project Manager's report is currently showing completion in mid-February. There is potential to get the kitchen back prior to this (December 2022). In order to bring the new kitchen online, a 2 week handover period between the temporary and the new kitchens will be needed.

b. **Great Hall**

The College has received a £1.5 million donation for works in the Great Hall and Chapel, predicated on making the Great Hall more flexible for music performance use. The initial feasibility study showed the project above the £1.5 million, but this included some work in the Small Hall which has now been removed. The works to the Great Hall include redecoration, lighting, passive ventilation (additional openable windows), and forced ventilation (extraction only). Acoustic works are under review as no suitable solution has been found to date. Part of the work is to take apart the existing furniture and make the furniture more easily movable and stackable. Conservation Committee has fed back on the proposed chairs and the intention is to have a College specific chair. The College is being pushed for an early decision on the furniture owing to rising prices of European oak. A joint meeting of Old Court Working Party and Conservation Committee is being scheduled for the end of term to decide on the proposed decorative and lighting schemes.

The College is moving forward quickly with this project, with a meeting with the Conservation Officer due on 19 May.

Consideration is being given to works to the Small Hall (minor) which will be funded as a separate project.

6. **Queen Edith and Netherfield Site**

Following discussions with the MCR on possible options for redeveloping the site, it has not been possible to find a solution that the MCR supported. The MCR raised concerns around any development in the location and is looking for low cost rental options for graduate students, and requested the College look into purchasing a house on Mill Road. The College had a house on Mill Road during the last academic year and it was not possible to fill the rooms. The house was subsequently sold. Although the MCR requested non en suite rooms for lower rents, it was noted that there was a disconnect between this and student behaviour, with voids in graduate properties almost always in the non en suite rooms.

MP Real Estate are developing a proposal for a commercial redevelopment of one of the sites. The low popularity of the flats with graduate students meant all current demand could be met with one of the two buildings alone.

Recommendations will be presented to the next meeting.

7. **Braeside**

a. **Planning**

The first planning application was withdrawn on advice of the Council, as they did not like the external insulation, windows, or flat-roofed dormers. Jon Burgess (advisor on Old Court project) challenged some of the comments, and

the Architect wrote a paper using information of other schemes by the original architect and examples of dormers in the vicinity. Following a pre-app meeting on site, the planners agreed with the resubmission but may condition the windows. The application was resubmitted less than a week after the pre-app, so the project remains on target for starting on site towards the end of this summer.

b. **Budget**

The pre-tender estimate has increased by £94,000 in the period since the last estimate to £1.1 million. There are now more details on the design, and in the current market it is not surprising that the price has increased.

c. **Design**

Question as to whether the render could have more texture and be light grey rather than white will be put to the Architect. DH

d. **Programme**

The project is due to go out to tender in early June, with a start on site date in the last week of August. This will mean that tender returns will be in summer vacation. The Bursar will seek delegated authority from the Finance Committee. The whole project is due to complete by the end of June 2023, ready for the summer schools. During exam period, the works are expected to be internal, so there should not be any noise break out. DB

8. **10 Year Programme**

a. **Overview**

The programme as presented at the committee was a working document, and did not include all of the Carbon Zero items. Some years had significantly more money in them than others, 2023/24 was £1.5 million over allocation and 2025/26 £2 million over.

The available funding for capital projects was £3 million (in the first four years of the programme 1 million to go to Old Court).

b. **Key Items**

- Sustainable heating for Memorial Court
- Hillside refurbishment
- PQR roof, insulation, and en suites

c. **Costs**

Most items are in at a base level, and this shows the normal rolling level of funding needed for an estate like Clare's. It would be possible to ask a QS to look at the costs and estimate what inflation might be.

d. **Redecoration**

External cannot be left longer than 7 years as this leads to significant repair work. Internal decoration could be left slightly longer, but it is now on a regular rolling programme, rather than rooms being picked off as and when they look particularly bad. The internal decorating is a comparatively low value item. Delaying Hillside / KLM would have more of an impact on the overall programme. To be considered closer to the time.

e. **Funding for Art Committee and Conservation Committee**

Art Committee have been given expense revenue. Conservation Committee requested funding to carry out projects like updated display cases in the Fellows' Library and other furnishings. Indicative items for the scope would be useful prior to the next Finance Committee (20 June). TF

9. **Boathouse**

In 2015 the Boat Club raised that they would like to extend the Boathouse. This was turned down at the time owing to the focus on Old Court. It has now been raised again, with a proposal to fundraise for a major extension. Owing to the listing, it was not possible to knock it down and rebuild it. This item is just to flag that this will be considered by other committees.

10. **Sustainable Heating for Memorial Court**

a. ***Background***

For several years the College has been investigating a sustainable heating solution to replace the aging gas boilers in Memorial Court. A report was presented on the possibilities of using air source and ground source heat pumps.

b. ***Heating Experiment***

Work was carried out with Joey Bream (fourth year engineering student) in March to investigate the effect of lower flow temperatures in the radiators on student comfort. The results showed that although students were not entirely happy, there were no complaints. However the weather at this time of year is not particularly cold. The buildings generally maintained the required temperatures (minimum 18.5C). The boilers were run for longer and used less gas. This was a good outcome in every way and has helped to inform the commissioned work. An additional, similar, project is needed next year, but advice will be sought from a boiler engineer first to make sure that the lower flow temperatures will not harm the boilers if carried out for a prolonged period.

c. ***Use of Air Source or Ground Source Heat Pumps***

The initial report shows that without too much interference in the fabric of the buildings, Memorial Court is suitable for air or ground source heat pumps. There is sufficient space for Ground Source on the site for Memorial Court (although Thirkill & Lerner need to be considered), and a suitable position (skip compound) for Air Source. The caveat is that the report has only covered Memorial an Ashby Court, and not Lerner and Thirkill Court, where the boilers also need replacing. The first indications of the report are positive, however.

d. ***Fabric Upgrades***

The main fabric upgrade required is to double glaze the windows. There are modern glazing methods that enable replacement of the panes within existing sash windows.

e. ***Other Options***

The University has talked about a heat network that would extend to the University Library. There is no date for when this might arrive, and the University Library has recently had new gas boilers installed.

11. **Routemap to Net Zero**

a. ***Target Dates***

Finance permitting, it is possible to achieve 90% reduction in emissions (considered minimum for net zero, with remainder offset) by 2038. This is the stretching target date set by the University. The University has also proposed a 75% reduction by 2030. A way to achieve this for the College was included in the report, but this was not thought to be feasible.

The Environment Committee recommended that the 75% by 2030 target was not set, as it was unlikely to be met. The 90% by 2038 was supported, and it was noted that this would still be aspirational.

b. **Old Court**

Without changing the heat source for Old Court, it was not possible to reach 75% reduction by 2030. Old Court has recently had boilers installed, so this would mean replacing them early. The College is also in discussions with the other River Colleges around River Source Heat Pumps, but it is unlikely to be ready for River Source by 2030.

Ground Source was not possible on the town side of the River Cam within Clare. Any Ground Source installed in the Fellows' Garden would need pipework to connect to Old Court.

12. **Update on Special Expenditure 2021-22**

Centre Drive Gates: New lock cases arrived but not fitted owing to weather

Memorial Court Boilers: See Item 10

Porters' Lodge Re-Roofing: Completed summer 2021, slightly over budget.

St Andrews & St Giles Boiler Replacement: Completed summer 2021, slightly over budget

Braeside Redevelopment: See Item 7

Castle House Paving: Completed summer 2021

Castle Street Damp: Damp proofing completed over Easter vacation, decorating and internal works underway

12a Heating and Ventilation: Completed summer 2021

69 Alpha Road (Air Source Heat Pump and Kitchen): Put off till summer 2022, tenders have been received but are high (25% increase from 2021), so being checked in more detail. Kitchen will be done in house.

Etheldreda Kitchens and Bathrooms: Work completed within budget.

Clare Court External Decorating: Some issues with the scaffolding around traffic lights and traffic management

Gas Meter Upgrade: Completed Easter 2022

Thirkill Court Internal Decorating: Completed summer 2021

Lerner Court Internal Decorating: First floor completed summer 2021

Fellows' Library Improvements: Underway, scaffolding in place, paint on ceiling. Will complete this year.

Forbes Mellon Library External Decorations: Completed summer 2021

33 Chesterton Road Conversion: Works not started (Master in residence), has been put in for planning

Condition Survey: Completed, information added to 10 year plan

Carbon Zero Strategy: See Item 11

AccessAble: App which gives accessibility information has been completed.

Most other Colleges and the University have also had this work done.

Additional rooms in Old Court will be added after the refurbishment is complete.

Castle End Booster Set: Plant broke down, now resolved.

Health and Wellbeing: See Item 4c

Great Hall and Chapel: See Item 5b

W Basement Pump: Emergency work following break down

W Basement Plant Room: Following an issue with the Buildings Management System in W Basement a number of issues were highlighted, so there is a significant amount of work to carry out. This is not with the boilers themselves, but all the associated equipment which is also very old.

13. **AOB**

a. **Room Allocation Process**

A new Rooms Committee has been set up, reporting directly to Council, but has not yet met. The Committee will be responsible for the overall rooms' strategy, with allocation of specific rooms then being put to the relevant committees / groups (Fellows' Room Group, Tutorial Office). Although named the Rooms Committee, the committee's remit included space planning, which was not the same thing.

Historically the College has not had enough public rooms, and they have not all been suitably used. This committee was to look at the overall emerging needs of the College, and would be expected to get input from the various groups in the College.

The Chair of the Conservation Committee strongly emphasised the need for Conservation Committee involvement in this process, as the group had been set up to look after the College's historic rooms. A number of decisions on room use had been taken in the past without input from the Conservation Committee, and there was a concern that rooms needed to be allocated with due consideration for their historic significance.

b. **Master's Lodge Improvements**

These were discussed at Finance Committee, with a budget set.

c. **Anticipated Capital Expenditure**

The Rooms management system will not be supported from next June, with an estimated replacement cost of £50,000 to £60,000.

14. **Dates of Meetings**

2 November 2022, 2pm, Elton Bowring Room

8 February 2023, 2pm, Elton Bowring Room

24 May 2023, 2pm, River Wing Café

Distribution: Professor Phil Allmendinger (Chair); Mr David Ball (Bursar); Professor Andrew Balmford (Chair of the Environment Committee, ex officio); Dr Jo Costin (Secretary); Miss Emma Easterbrook (Assistant Bursar); Dr Tamara Follini (Chair of the Conservation Committee, ex officio); Dr Andrew Friend; Professor Howard Griffiths (Chair of the Gardens Committee, ex officio); Mr Daniel Patten (UCS Representative); Ms Deborah Hoy (Estates Director); Mr Brenan Morgan (Head Porter); Mr Patrick Taylor (MCR Representative); Professor Wendy Pullan; Mr Jason Randall (IT Manager); and Professor Jacqueline Tasioulas (Senior Tutor).

For information: Lily Rafalin (UCS President); Will Wood (MCR President).